



Comparative Analysis of Historiographic Metafiction in Winterson's *The Passion* and Morrison's *Beloved*

Imran Hussain

Department of English Language & Literature
The University of Lahore, Pakistan

Abstract: The prime intend of the current research is to comparatively evaluate two postmodern novels i.e. Jeanette Winterson's *The Passion* and Toni Morrison's *Beloved* through the perspective of historiographic metafiction. Hence, researcher is designed to analyze and highpoint the historical reality and identity through the lens of literal and fictional perspective. Historiographic metafiction is an imperative gadget to pinpoint the historical chronicles of the actual events at one hand and the fictional and literal perception at the other without being slice of conformist historical writers or writings where history is obtainable in an objective and sequential style. In order to comparatively analyze both the novels the researcher has utilized qualitative and descriptive approach. The foremost source of analysis is the text of the novels and purposive sampling maneuver has been operated to disintegrate historiographic metafictional rudiments from the novels and then concisely both the novels have been analyzed and pronounced. The analysis is clinched on the note that both the novels are having exact essence of historiographic metafiction. Similarities and dissimilarities have been fetched to light by the researcher to throw light on the insight of literal and fictional reality in both the novels. The slant of both novelists is distinctively dissimilar the way they have treated historical realities and identities and have offered the concept of multiple interpretations and identities.

Keywords: historiographic metafiction, fictional history, realist history, subjective and objective historical narration, wars and slavery



Introduction

Historiographic metafiction plays a pivot facade as far as delineating the historical perspective of events that essentially transpired in the past but these are accessible through a literal and fictional tenor rather than an objective record of events. Historiographic metafiction is a genre that has been devised by Linda Hutcheon who was a Canadian fictional theorist in the last decade of 20th century. It has unified three essential fundamentals i.e. history, fiction and theory. Underneath this genre historical events and realities are assumed new-fangled dynamic which is no more a static and utter realities rather it has engaged subjective and multiple attributes. The history is no more than the accounts of events and arecord of events transpired in the past. Historiographic metafiction generates a bridge between two dynamics i.e. history and fiction. History and identity are revealed through literal and fictional lens. It has originated to amalgam both literal metafiction and historical fiction.

Jeanette Winterson is an influential British writer and novelist. She is superlatively branded for her writing which is in agreement with postmodern tendencies at one hand and historiographic metafiction at the other especially while chatting about *The Passion*, the novel under analysis. In addition, she has accomplished prominent spot among literary circle due to her distinctive elegance and means of narration. She receipts foci and themes that are conventional yet her handling is exceptional and idiosyncratic. She is seemly influential due to two illustrious topographies of her inscription. One, the feminist facade of her writing, two, the mode she has incapacitated the barricades of orthodoxy of pick up the check of majestic and historical proceedings in chronological manner. She has enunciated for those who is the marginalized class in the interior of a communal set up and specified an innovative dynamic to gender identity as per is itemized by Armitt (2005) “She shifts between centuries, spatio-temporal planes, and sometimes genders in her journeys into and through the mystery of the narrative subject in order to decenter assumptions about character construction, sexuality, and historical causality” (p. 155).

Analogous to true postmodernand historiographic meta-fictionist, she emanates up with the conception of multiple elucidations and identities which are conditional on personal and



distinctive perspective rather than sheer a record of historical events which are objective and grounded on personal account. She has subverted and encounters the historical realistic narrative and substituted it with fictional historical incline. Doan (1994) has encapsulated her vista as “Winterson constructs her narrative by exploiting the techniques of postmodern historiographic metafiction (such as intertextuality, parody, pastiche, self-reflexivity, fragmentation, the rewriting of history, and frame breaks) as well as its ideology (questioning grand narratives, problematizing closure, valorizing instability, suspecting coherence and so forth) in order to challenge and subvert patriarchal and heterosexist discourses and, ultimately, to facilitate a forceful and positive radical oppositional critique” (p. 138).

The Passion, under analysis is a novel that is staged in context with factual and historical events that centered on Napoleon war. It is an anecdote re-counted by two raconteurs i.e. Henri, the prominent masculine character and French soldier and Villanelle the prime female figure. The gender traits of both have been swapped by Winterson. Henri is publicized as one having dearth of masculine tenor as he is homesick and dread of darkness while Villanelle is exposed a woman, who roams in the streets, exerts in a casino, gambles and attires costume of male. In addition, authentic persons, places and period are there which are factual and are symptomatic of the historical context of the novel but the way Winterson has fingered history in a fictional and literal mode that is unquestionably in line with historiographic meta-fictionist gist rather than of realist and historical chronicle of the conventional writers who were record reencounters and sequential in their description. Furthermore, memory, parody, magic realism and the novelty of gender role in *The Passion* is assertive of the datum that it is a postmodern novel at one hand and his toriographic metafictional at the other.

Conversely, author of *Beloved*, the second novel under analysis is a prolific and a prominent Afro-American who earned Noble Prize for her literary services in the year 1993. Allen (1994) justified her winning the most prestigious award when delineated her craftsmanship and artistic stature “her novels characterized by visionary force and poetic import, gives life to an essential aspect of American reality” (p. 42). She was amongst the first of black women writer and the only one till now who earned this Prize. She obliged literary skyline for morethan 40



years and have been bestowed with plentiful awards due to her literary limelight. Her literary renown and artistic person have been summed up by Peterson (1993) as “Toni Morrison has become the name around which debates of considerable significance to American literature, culture, and ideology have amassed.” (p. 465).

She is regarded as the most persuasive and impact carrier literary voice among black Afro-American especially among women of her race. She elasticizes vocal sound to her women with rationality, valor and supremacy of tenacity to endure and revolt in contradiction of the pacts of slavery, gender discrimination and class biasness. She glorifies the conducts of those women who agitated and waged a battle against prevailing injustice and brutalities that they as a gender and class have to undertake. Although most of her writings are inscribed in Afro-American context, civil combat and scuffle for human rights which are truthful and historical narration of the past accounts yet the novelty she coils to her portrayal is strikingly diverse from that of historical realists and her fictional historical incline doesn't bound reality or identity to be as fixed and objective as was in the inscription of historical realists. Her novel *Beloved*, under discussion, is a paramount instance of her historiographic metafictional credentials and slant.

Beloved is estimated by Walter Clemon (1987) as “I think we have a masterpiece on our hand here” (p. 75) while The New York Times supposed it “best American fiction in 25 years”. It is an account of those black Afro-Americans who were to face slavery and lots of cruelties such as injustice, gender and class discrimination. Through Sethe, the chief women charisma she has anticipated optimisms and light among darkness that slavery can be shattered and light of freedom and human rights can be bestowed if one has the drive to revolt and subvert the prevailing norms. Feminist glorification is publicized concluded the fact that her foremost character and narrator is a female voice and she has the valor to endure woe and yet the will to encounter the slavery by a shot she made to run away from the slavehouse. With the intention of save her kids from slavery she endeavored to slaughter them and eventually slays her third kid a daughter who lingers to rendezvous her and her family in theform of ghost and the novel is baptized after her “beloved”.



Research Objectives

Present study is intended to analyze the historiographic metafictional rudiments in two novels *The Passion* and *Beloved*. For that the researcher has sketched the succeeding research objectives.

- To reconnoiter the idiosyncratic narrative of historiographic meta-fictionists with regard to history.
- To unearth the mingling of history and fiction as a mean to pinpoint assorted realities and identities with respect to historical recounts.
- To underline the historiographical similarities institute in *The Passion* and *Beloved* under debate.
- To spot dissimilarities with regard to historiographic metafiction in the novels *The Passion* and *Beloved*.

Research Questions

Bearing in view the objectives and resolve of the study subsequent research queries are conscripted.

- How history has been presented distinctively in *Beloved* and *The Passion* two postmodern novels?
- How historiographic metafiction has contributed in mingling history and fiction to unearth the notion of subjective and multiple realities and interpretations of historical events?
- What are the prime historiographical similarities between two novels *The Passion* and the *Beloved*?
- Are there any dissimilarity too with respect to historiographical metafiction in *Beloved* and *The Passion*?

Theoretical Underpinnings

In order to analyze both the novels historiographic metafiction has been kept in view as a theoretical consideration. The advent of postmodernism has a far-reaching stimulus on every sphere of human bustle and literary dynamics cannot be left overdue from being under its



ascendency (Carter, 2012). The perception of history and historical chronicle has commenced systematic transformation under historiographic metafiction. It is no more a sheer record of historical recounts in a sequential order. There are no fixed, out-and-out and objective connotations that can be aligned under historiographic metafictional narrative, rather notion of multiple interpretations and diverse identities grounded on subjective contemplation have been familiarized under this umbrella. Hutcheon (1989), the initiator of this conception of historiographic metafiction labeled it “self-conscious within the archive” while New York Trilogy painstaking it as “This world has direct links to the world of empirical reality, but it is not itself that empirical reality.”

The illustrious distinction associated with historiographic metafiction is what the unification of history and literature is. Historical narrations have been emblazoned through the lens of fiction and literary gist dissimilar to historical fictionists who apportioned it by means of sequential order of the events. The identical is cited by Hutcheon (2004) “those well-known and popular novels which are both intensely self-reflexive and yet paradoxically also lay claim to historical events and personages” (p. 5). As the name recommends it comprises of two interrelated terms i.e. historiographic and metafiction. It is adequately demarcated by Furay & Salevouris (1988) as “the study of the way history has been and is written- the history and historical writing... When you study historiography, you do not study the events of the past directly, but the changing interpretations of those events in the works of individual historians” (p. 223).

While Patricia Waugh (1984) pigeon-holed it as “a term given to fictional writing which self-consciously and systematically draws attention of its status as an artifact in order to pose questions about the relationship between fiction and reality” (p. 2). “Parody, paratextuality, and historical re-conceptualization” are the vital topographies of historiographic metafiction. Mingling of history and fiction and illustration of history through fictional lens is yet additional distinctive attribute of this genre. The notion is amply delineated by Hutcheon (2003) subsequently:

“What has surfaced is something different from the unitary, closed, evolutionary



narratives of historiography as we have traditionally known it: [in historiographic metafiction] we now get the histories of the losers as well as the winners, of the regional (and colonial) as well as the centrist, of the unsung many as well as the much sung few, and [...] of women as well as men” (p. 66).

In all and all the relation of history and historiographic metafiction can be summed up like this as to brand it more coherent and accessible

“In historiographic metafiction, history is subjective and perspectival”

“History is a product of language”

“History is manufactured in the power-plant of our imagination”

Comparative Analysis

Present study is intended to analyze the historiographic metafictional rudiments in two novels *The Passion* and *Beloved* comparatively. One by one the researcher has sightseen diverse historiographic meta-fictional rudiments from both the novels. Keeping in mind those topographies and the objectives of the study this slice is intended to study both the novels side by side as a comparative analysis. In this regard the researcher has evaluated and lured some similarities amid both the novels in regard to historiographic metafiction. Let's have the analogous designs or notions that are there in both the novels under discussion to be pierced out first with regard to comparative analysis.

Similarities

The first similarity among both the novels is that both are inscribed in the identical literary period which is termed as post modernism. *Beloved* was extolled in 1987 while *The Passion* was published a decade afterward the publication of *Beloved* in 1997. Hence, both are partaking the topographies that are the keys of the phase. Some of the mutual postmodern essentials that are originated in both the novel under analysis are “pastiche, intertextuality, metafiction, magic realism and parody.” Second, resemblance among them is the technique they preserved historical events and history. Prior to them there was an objective slant on the way to the truth or historical narrations. History was labeled as fixed and absolute truth and identity as was adorned in the books. But both Morrison and Winterson have laid a contrastive view of



commencing and picking up the check history as well as historical recounts. History is apportioned as subjective manner and uncluttered to plentiful and assorted interpretations and elucidations.

One of the utmost conspicuous likenesses among them is the innovative incline and pitch that was espoused and perfected by historiographic authors and that was the putting of fiction and history side by side with theory. This instrument has been perfected in the novels under discussion. Historical narrations, figures and even temporal eras are accurately recited and hinted by both the writers but as an alternative by dint of the narration of meticulous historical figures and events they have recreated it through the projection of fictional characters and events. Hence, it can be culminated that both the writers i.e. Morrison and Winterson have reoriented and renovated the perception of history and historical recounts. To them, history or historical narrations are much more than a mere record rather it is somewhat that is perceived by those who are interpreting and restructuring it. Interpretations are not what are there in historian minds, in the essence of historical writers or printed on the pages it is in the cognizance of the readers and explorers.

In both the novels we encompass the factual and exact indications of historical narrations and heroes along with precise time. For instance, in *The Passion*, “Napoleon, Josephine, Guy Fawkes, General Hoche, Madame Clicquot and Madame de Stael” are the actual historical figures that are anticipated. In *Beloved* we have the narration and projection of “Margaret Garner’s infanticide” but probable by mean of fictional means. But they have been projected by means of fictional characters in the novel i.e. Sethe’s infanticide that was actually the narration of “Margaret Garner’s infanticide” which is the modernization that has been brought to light by historiographic meta-fictionists.

Even the authentic nomenclature of the places is there which are historical as far as management of history is concerned. For illustration, in *The Passion* we have “Venice, Russia and England” as truthful accounts of places. And in *Beloved* we have the precise house name “124 house.” Even the time span is accurately quoted in *The Passion* it is 19th century while in *Beloved* it was the time of Afro-American slavery and the period of repercussion. But like a true



demonstrative of historiographic meta-fictionist there is no sequential order of the events being re-counted. Even in the mid of stern accounts, we have inconsequential and insignificant events being narrated by both the writers. For specimen, when chatting about Napoleon, being his cook, Henri as a replacement for fetching to light his personal or commandry attributes he chats about his fascination for chicken.

There is additional conspicuous common facet being evaluated in both the novels by researchers and that is that in both the novels there are historical narrations and recounts that are inter related with wars. In *The Passion* there are the narrations of Napoleon wars while in *Beloved* there is a description of civil war of Afro-American black slaves counter to slavery, tyranny and for the accomplishment of their civil as well as human privileges. Both Morrison and Winterson have subverted from the conventional tenor, chic and handling of historical proceedings by monolithic discourse. They reoriented and reconstructed the tone, style and means of in lieu of history and historical accounts which are founded on historiographic metafictional conventions.

Both the novels are consuming magical realism in them which is yet an alternative common historiographical component between them. Descriptions like “Villanelle’s webbed feet”, “walking on the Water”, “Villanelle’s stolen heart” and “Patrick’s telescopic eye” are the conspicuous imageries that are virtuously illusory, imaginary, fictional and these have been placed alongside with historical events and illustration of history in *The Passion* which is sternly in line with historiographical conventions of postmodern fictionists. Historical figures, places and time period are perceptibly instances of datum and truthful illustration while depiction of mysterious and fantastical fundamentals like “Queen of Spades” a mysterious married women whom Villanelle is in lesbian relation in *The Passion* and the very ghost of “beloved” in *Beloved* are illustrations of magical, fictional and fantastic essentials which joint both the novels as magic realist.

The perception of “memory” is a crucial as far as historical discourse is concerned and it is likewise equally momentous as far as the historiographical metafiction and its ethnicities are concerned. And in the novels under analysis it is a common façade to evaluate the impression of



memory. The very insight of Henri keeping a diary is the indication towards record keeping of the events which is pertinent to memory. Additionally, his narration about Napoleon and his warfare in the novel is correspondingly something grounded on his memory. Identical notion of memory is also instituted in Morrison's *Beloved*, in which protagonist "Sethe" slayed her daughter to set her free from the clutches of servitude and slavery but after that throughout her life she was not able to come out of the reminiscence of her daughter over and above of crime of slaughtering her who later haunted the entire family by means of a ghost termed as "beloved."

Alternative comparable feature that is conceivably an additional identical conspicuous to the extent that the comparative study is concerned is the mode and tenor both Morrison and Winterson have undertaken gender depiction. It is scrutinized that the narrators of the both the novels are feminine voices i.e. Sethe in *Beloved* and Villanelle in *The Passion*. It means the core chronicle narration is accomplished by two female writers from the mouth of two female reenounters. Hence, it is shared facet between the two novelists and as well as their narration medium that is feministic. Morrison is perhaps painstaking to be the most influential feminist writer of her time and the way Winterson has portrayed Villanelle "I dressed as a boy because that's what the visitors like to see. It was part of the game" (*Passion*, p.54) is not at all deficient behind Toni Morrison.

Another prominent shared portico that both the novels segmented relating to their historiographic meta-fictional analysis is the inculcation of self-reflexivity. The characters especially the leading role in both *The Passion* and *Beloved* are predestined for their self-reflexivity. In *The Passion*, Henri captivation to retain a diary is intimation in the direction of the identical datum he desires to preserve intact with regard to his life and conducts during his sojourn in the army. The entire charisma and individualities influenced by Villanelle in *The Passion* is likewise intended for self-projection. She attires boyish costume since it is adored by the sightseers at casino. She gambles, wanders in the streets and have lesbian frame of mind because these are her cravings and passions. On the other hand, the escapism of Sethe in *Beloved* also a shot to self-reflexivity and scheme her ownself and uniqueness in the mist of identity predicaments.



Glorification of women as gender and title role is likewise a mutual and analogous facet the researcher scrutinized during the analysis. Villanelle is anticipated as a dominating figure in *The Passion*. In addition, the mothers of both Villanelle and Henri in the novel are moreover depicted as authoritative and dominating figures. While in *Beloved* Sethe is estimated as a woman who regardless of all the melancholies campaigned in contradiction of the prevailing shackles of slavery and viewpoint as an emblem who is desirous to alter the convention of black with respect to culture and identity. This is a compliment to women like Sethe by Morrison. Additional momentous comparison that has noteworthy persona in the edifice and inclusive impact of both the novels is concerned in the execution of murder. In *Beloved*, Sethe murdered her own daughter in an attempt to except her from servitude which later evicted to be an outlandish nightmare and delinquency in her life. On the identical memorandum, Villanelle's husband is slayed in the novel *The Passion*, which is imagined or at least alleged Henri that he has slaughtered him and the entire culminating fragment of the novel is centered around the event.

Supplementary substantial historiographic resemblance that is initiated in both the novels under analysis is the perception of alternative actualities or identities. Both the novelists have subverted the predominant notion of veracity and distinctiveness and provoked to reorient the perception of truth and identity. In *The Passion* a conceivable substitute can be the conception of homosexuality attributable to the persona of Villanelle "Queen of Spades." While in *Beloved*, in the mist of unidentified identity, culture and truth, Morrison has flabbergasted to reorient the ancient culture, traditions and historical conventions that Afro-American owned prior to the slavery and she prompted to reinstall this essence in Afro-American through the glorifying portrayal of those black especially women who agitated the existing norms.

Accompanied noteworthy mutual facade that both the novels under analysis segment with regard to historiographic metafiction is that consumption of polarity and divergence of raconteurs. In *The Passion*, narration is accomplished through henri and Villanelle and likewise in *Beloved* though maximum of the narration is performed by mean of Sethe but there is also a third person narrator who too re-counted some of the anecdotes exclusively the tales after the



assassination of beloved and hang around at the “124 house” subsequently. Addedly weighty historiographic metafictional component that is pledged in both *The Passion* and *Beloved* is that both the novelists have additional captivation for fiction, fantasy and feelings rather than partaking primarily concerns for history, truth and chronological briefings of the narrations. Hence, it can be determined that both the novelists favor and prefer fiction over history.

The titles of both the novels under analysis are exceedingly emblematic and pertinent with regard to the leit motifs these are resounding. *The Passion* is envisioned for the appetite and cravings that are holding by Villanelle throughout the novel while *Beloved* is insignia of the “beloved” and her glimmer ghost that has been assassinated by her mother and who keeping the family haunted all the while. Last but not the least, mutually the novels as well as novelists have supported the story telling ethnicities alive. Through the means of storytelling they have anticipated their viewpoints. Fairy tales of Villanelle about her and her family while Sethe narration is consequential from Afro-American folklore traditions in *The Passion* and *Beloved* correspondingly.

Dissimilarities

After having gone through numerous semblances and resemblances that are there in *The Passion* and *Beloved* with respect to its scrutiny as historiographic metafictional analysis, this slice is preordained to bring to light those divergences that are there in both the novels under analysis and have been pin pointed by researcher as consequent part of comparative analysis.

The first dissimilarity that is scrutinized by the researcher is the very tenor, tone and environ that is there in both the novels. It is patently dissimilar. In *The Passion*, Villanelle prognosis about herself and her family is grounded on the conception that can be labeled as fairy tale while in disparity what is there in *Beloved* that is of hazard, menace, vanished and insecurity. Under the impression of slavery Sethe has a despicable lifecycle that has been depicted in the novel. Both the protagonists in the novels are in contrast to each other as far as the nature and persona of their characters are concerned. Villanelle is projected as having ebullient and care free nature who is accustomed to work in casino, gambles, roams in the streets and has lesbian association with “Queen of Spades” while in *Beloved* Sethe is accessible as an insignia of sin,



delinquency, desolation and servitude and she disbursed her entire life in the equivalent fit.

Though both the novels under analysis venture the elevation of women yet there is dissimilarity in the technique through which the glorification is carried out. In *The Passion*, Villanelle is glorified as lesbian and homosexual partaking more of masculine than of feminist traits nonetheless on the other hand, in divergence, Morrison anticipated women as an emblem of astuteness, zealous, courageous and those who have resilience and recalcitrant in nature. Such women, to her, will be gifted to reorient the fate of black Afro-American slaves notwithstanding of all the desolations and personal dejection these have. There is yet additional outstanding divergence in both the novels specifically with respect to the treatment and gender roles. In *The Passion* women are anticipated as authoritative, unrestricted and autonomous having even lesbian and homosexual conception towards the sex. Lust and sexual nature are there in *Beloved* but dissimilar to *The Passion*. When Sethe is grabbed with other slaves they were all men who casted lustfully at her. So, there is a disparity as far as sex and gender is labeled in both the novels.

In *The Passion* we have fantastical imageries and illustration of the proceedings and characters “Villanelle’s stolen heart” and “Patrick’s telescopic eye” but contrastingly in *Beloved* these images and portrayals are not perceptible rather melancholies, torment and anguish all over the occurrences so this is yet additional disparate feature we have in both the novels. In both the novels under analysis the role and persona of mothers is dissimilar. In *The Passion*, the mother of Villanelle and Henri are both estimated as authoritative but in *Beloved* the role of Sethe as a mother is not as glorifying as that of Henri who has durable liking for his mother and conceivably due to her he is always home sick. Sethe as a woman and as a mother is acquiescent and subjugated.

Winterson has rehabilitated and transformed the gender roles in *The Passion*; Villanelle is publicized as having more of masculine attributes than of female, crossing dressing, lesbian feelings, roaming, gambling, etc. Henri alternatively is constantly sick for home and has terror of dimness which are more of feminine than of masculine traits but such gender crossing traits are absolutely absent in the novel *Beloved*. Here both male and female irrespective of their gender



roles were subjugated and slaved by white. In *The Passion* we have feministic expansion is mand exaltation when placed in comparison to male but in disparity to it in *Beloved* we have culture, lingual and identity grounded imperialism of black Afro American who are subjugated and imperialized by white.

Thematic variance can also be manifested by the researcher pertaining to the analysis of both the novels. In *The Passion*, we have love, bliss, gambling and passion as conspicuous melodies but in *Beloved* mere slavery, anguish and crime spot their presence as themes. As far as structure is concerned, we have four fragments structure in *The Passion* but in Morrison *Beloved* there are three slices. In *The Passion* we have protagonist and his valiant deeds like Napoleon but in *Beloved* we have perceived slavery and cultural imperialism and it is endorsed through Margaret Garner who was slave and who slayed her own daughter which is fictionalized through the slaying of beloved.

Conclusion

Bearing in mind the objectives of the study and after having analyzed both the novels *The Passion* and *Beloved* it can be determined that both the novels are inscribed keeping in view the conventions of historiographic metafiction. There are certain noteworthy topographies of this genre that can be originated in both the novels under debate. The researcher has scrutinized that both the novels stake the consumption of multiple raconteurs practice i.e. in *The Passion* we have Henri and Villanelle and in *Beloved* we have Sethe and the third person narrator. Both the novels are dedicated to extant the idiosyncratic, fictional and reoriented perceptions of history, truth and identities. In addition, the notion of memory is initiated in both the novels as well; Sethe is repetitively haunted by the reminiscences of her slayed daughter while in order to keep her memory and events alive, Henri retains a diary. The narration of war is also there in both the novels i.e. Civil war and Napoleon war in *Beloved* and *The Passion* correspondingly.

Self-reflexivity can also be perceived in both the novels, in *The Passion* it is projected through Villanelle cross dressing, carefree nature and jolly mood and in *Beloved* through Sethe escapism and an attempt to run away. Both the novels are campaigner of feminist feast and postured women glorification i.e. in *The Passion* Villanelle is anticipated and glorified by



Winterson through her traits, being protagonist and dominated persona and in *Beloved* Sethe is advertised because of her courage and perseverance in spite of slavery and adversities she had the valor to dissident in contradiction of the predominant standards of the era. In both the novels, novelists are concerned to scheme and implanted the perception of alternative identities i.e. in *The Passion* the substitute can be homosexuality and in *Beloved* freedom and deprived of the imperialistic compression of white and superior can be the substitute. All these facades are not only communal in both these novels these are also substantial historiographic meta-fictional fundamentals that are shared by both these novels as a demonstrative of historiographic metafiction.

Works Cited

- Armitt, L. (2005). *Fantasy fiction: an introduction*. USA, New York: The Continuum International Publishing.
- Carter, D. (2012). *Literary Theory*. Oldcastle Books.
- Clemons, W. (1987). A grave stone of memories. *Newsweek*, 28, 74-75.
- Doan, L. (1994). Jeanette Winterson's sexing the postmodern. *The lesbian postmodern*, 137-55.
- Furay, C., & Slevouris, M. (1988). *The methods and skills of history: A practical guide*. Arlington Heights, IL: Harlan Davidson.
- Hussain, I. (2024). Exploring the Impact of Learning Styles on Tailoring Individual Learners' Needs: A Systemic Review. *Journal of Management & Educational Research Innovation*, 2(1), 16-26.
- Hussain, I., & Mansoor, S. (2017). Stylistics Analysis of Sylvia Plath's Poem Poppies in October. *Journal of Literature, Languages and Linguistics*, 33, 23-27.
- Hutcheon, Linda. (2003). *The Politics of Postmodernism*. New York: Taylor & Francis eLibrary. (first published by Routledge in 1995).
- Hussain, I., Rahat, R., & Parveen, T. (2023). Harnessing Artificial Intelligence for Dynamic Landscape: Re-envisioning English Language Teaching in Pakistan. *University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, 7(II), 256-264.



- Hutcheon, Linda. (2004). *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction*. New York: Taylor & Francis e-Library. (first published by Routledge in 1988).
- Hussain, I., Rahat, R., & Parveen, T. (2024). Empowering Minds, Transforming Futures: Advancing Multiple Intelligences through English Language Teaching in Pakistan. *International Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 3(1), 776-790.
- Hutcheon, Linda. (1989). "Historiographic Metafiction: Parody and the Intertextuality of History" *Intertextuality and Contemporary American Fiction*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, pp.3-32.
- Hussain, I., Waqas, M., & Miran, G. (2025). Echoing Global Voices: Fostering Global Citizenship through English Language Teaching in Pakistan. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and TESOL (JALT)*, 8(3), 986-995.
- Hussain, I., Parveen, T., & Mehmood, Z. (2024). Nurturing Environmental Sustainability through Green Contents: Exploring Eco-centric Consciousness among English Language Learners in Pakistan. *Pakistan Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(2), 71-82.
- Linda, H. (1988). *A Poetics of Postmodernism; History Theory Fiction*. London: Cambridge UP.
- Morrison, T. (2004). *Beloved*. 1987. New York: Vintage
- Peterson, N. J. (1993). *Introduction: Canonizing Toni Morrison. Modern Fiction Studies*, 39(3/4), 461-479.
- Taghizadeh, A., & Ebrahimi, M.J. (2015). Paul Auster's New York Trilogy as "historiographic metafiction". *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 5(9), 1908.
- Waugh, P. (1984). *Metafiction: The Theory and Practice of Self-Conscious Fiction* (London, 1984). hereafter cited in text as M, 9.
- Winterson, J. (1997). *The Passion*. New York: GroveP